May 20, 2020

Attn: Mr. Don Chamblee, PE
Public Works Director
Lincoln County
115 W. Main Street
Lincolnton, NC 28092

RE: Lincoln County, North Carolina
Killian Creek WWTP Ph 3 Upgrade
WKD Project Number #20170294.00.CL
Bid Tabulation and Recommendation

Dear Mr. Chamblee:

Enclosed is the Certified Bid Tabulation for the subject project. The three lowest bidders, listed in ascending order, are PC Construction Company, Lane Construction Corporation, and Wharton-Smith, Inc.

During our review of the seven bids that were submitted for the project, we found the following math errors:

- PC Construction Company, rounded Line Item 5.04, Contingency Allowance up to the nearest dollar, from $1,426,857.50 to $1,426,858.00.
- Lane Construction, rounded Line Item 5.04, Contingency Allowance up the nearest dollar, from $1,454,018.85 to $1,454,019.00.

The Certified Bid Tabulation reflects the corrected numbers.

Other comments based on our review of the bid documents received from the three lowest bidders are as follows:

- All three bidders included the Owner preferred alternate equipment items as their base bid except for the electric motor actuators. All three bidders listed AUMA actuators as their base bid, offering a deduct averaging $60,000.
- All three bidders acknowledged receipt of all five (5) addenda.
• There were no irregularities in the Statement of Qualifications submitted by any of the three lowest bidders. All provided substantial evidence of their qualifications to perform the work of the project.

• PC Construction, Lane and Wharton-Smith all provided the Good Faith Efforts Form earning greater than 50 points and identification of minority business participation with none meeting the 10% MBE/WBE goal for the project.

Since we have no recent experience with the work of PC Construction Company, we reviewed the Statement of Qualifications provided as part of the bid package required by the Contract documents. The Statement of Qualifications required examples of similar experience, references, safety records, etc.

The majority of the current and similar projects provided in PC Construction Company’s Statement of Qualifications were plant projects located in the eastern United States. The company is headquartered in Vermont. We focused our reference research to similar projects in size and scope and located in the southeast. We contacted several references that were provided in the Statement of Qualifications. A detailed summary of feedback received is attached for your reference. In summary, the feedback was positive.

After contacting their references, reviewing their safety records, gaining an understanding of their knowledge of their experience with a project of this nature, review of their Statement of Qualifications, and their reputation throughout the industry, we feel confident that they are prepared and capable to perform the work. We believe that PC Construction Company provided the lowest responsive bid in the amount of $29,964,007.50. This price does not include an additional $57,000 for providing the Owner Preferred EIM electric motor actuators. Upon consulting with Lincoln County staff, it is agreed and recommended to utilize the contractors base bid equipment manufacturer, AUMA, for the electric motor actuators and forgo the additional cost.

Before proceeding we recommend that Lincoln County review the bid package provided by PC Construction Company thoroughly for consideration of selection for this project.
We appreciate the opportunity to provide this service for Lincoln County, and we are available to answer any questions you may have.

Sincerely,

W. K. Dickson & Co., Inc.

Ryan W. Hager, P.E.
Project Manager

RWH:ae

Enclosures:  Tabulations of all bids received (sealed by engineer)
Summary of References
## Killian Creek WWTP Design 3 Construction

### Bid Tabulation

**BID DATE: MAY 12, 2020 @ 2:00 PM**

**Lincoln County**, **NC**

#### Killian Creek WWTP Phase 3 Design

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Item Description</th>
<th>Quantity</th>
<th>Unit</th>
<th>Unit Price</th>
<th>Base Bid Price</th>
<th>Total Bid Price</th>
<th>Unit Price</th>
<th>Base Bid Price</th>
<th>Total Bid Price</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>501</td>
<td>Jump-Mix Bid Price for Base Bid</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>LS</td>
<td>27,578,900.00</td>
<td>$27,578,900.00</td>
<td>28,411,977.00</td>
<td>$28,411,977.00</td>
<td>30,027,000.00</td>
<td>$30,027,000.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Bid Cost Items

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Equip. or Product</th>
<th>Mnfr.</th>
<th>Base Bid</th>
<th>Add/Deduct to Base Bid for &quot;Alternative Owner Preferred Equip. or Product&quot;</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Aeration Equipment</td>
<td>Finish Thompson</td>
<td>$29,964,007.50</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phosphate Feed Equipment</td>
<td>Xylem, Flygt</td>
<td>$29,080,377.00</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rotary Sludge Press</td>
<td>AUMA</td>
<td>$28,537,150.00</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Submersible Pumps</td>
<td>Borger</td>
<td>$27,500,000.00</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Submersible Pumps in Post Equalization Basins</td>
<td>Xylem, Hyfl</td>
<td>$26,500,000.00</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Submersible Sludge Pumps</td>
<td>EIM</td>
<td>$24,000,000.00</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sludge Holding, Incline Jet Aeration Pumps</td>
<td>Wilo</td>
<td>$22,500,000.00</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sludge Holding, Incl. Jet Aeration Pumps in SBR, Digestor, and Bridge Holding</td>
<td>Wilo</td>
<td>$20,000,000.00</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Submersible Sludge Pumps in Post Equalization Basins</td>
<td>Xylem, Hyfl</td>
<td>$18,000,000.00</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SBR &amp; Digestor Equipment Including Jet Aeration</td>
<td>Evoqua</td>
<td>$16,000,000.00</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rotary Sludge Press Equipment &amp; Accessories</td>
<td>Fourmar</td>
<td>$14,000,000.00</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rotary Sludge Press Equipment &amp; Accessories</td>
<td>Fourmar</td>
<td>$12,000,000.00</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Automatic Backwash</td>
<td>Kruger</td>
<td>$10,000,000.00</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Contingency Allowance @ 5% of Subtotal

- Base Bid for "Alternative Owner Preferred Equip. or Product"

- Total Base Bid (Jump Sum, Unit Cost Items and Contingency Allowance)

**Line Item Costs**

- **Project Contingency Allowance**: 5% of Subtotal

**Total Base Bid** (Jump Sum, Unit Cost Items and Contingency Allowance)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Unit Cost Items</th>
<th>Lump Sum Bid Price</th>
<th>Owner Preferred</th>
<th>Base Bid for &quot;Alternative Owner Preferred Equip. or Product&quot;</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Trench Rock Material</td>
<td>$29,080,377.00</td>
<td>$28,537,150.00</td>
<td>$28,000,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Offsite Disposal of Rock Material</td>
<td>$28,411,977.00</td>
<td>$30,027,000.00</td>
<td>$31,500,000.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Schedule A: Tabulation of Major Equipment Items and Products**

- **ACMA System Modifications**
- **Jet Aeration Equipment**
- **Displacement Blower Compressors**
- **Submersible Pumps**
- **Inclined Jet Aeration Pumps**
- **Submersible Pumps in Post Equalization Basins**
- **SBR & Digestor Equipment Including Jet Aeration**
- **Rotary Sludge Press Equipment & Accessories**
- **Automatic Backwash**

---

**Lincoln County**

Killian Creek WWTP Phase 3 Design

**WHI Project Number**: 2157980-00-CL

**Bid Tabulation**

Page 1
### BID TABULATION
LINCOLN COUNTY, NC
KILLIAN CREEK WWTP DESIGN 3 CONSTRUCTION
BID DATE: MAY 12, 2020 @ 2:00 PM

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Item Description</th>
<th>Quantity/Unit</th>
<th>Unit Price</th>
<th>Total Bid Price</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.01</td>
<td>Pump Sump Bid Price for Base Bid</td>
<td>1 LS</td>
<td>$31,887,000.00</td>
<td>$31,887,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.02</td>
<td>Unit Cost Items</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.03</td>
<td>Subtotal Base Bid (Lump Sum and Unit Cost Items)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$32,966,500.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.04</td>
<td>Contingency Allowance at 5% of Subtotal</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$1,693,405.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total Base Bid (Lump Sum, Unit Cost Items and Contingency Allowance)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$34,659,905.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>34 45 00</td>
<td>SCADA System Modifications</td>
<td>Donnet</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46 90 33 11</td>
<td>Electric Motor Actuators</td>
<td>ICM</td>
<td>$79,000.00</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$75,000.00</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46 11 19</td>
<td>Positive Displacement Blower Assemblies</td>
<td>Ensinor</td>
<td>$71,000.00</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$50,000.00</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46 21 13</td>
<td>Centrifugal Chemical Pumps</td>
<td>Fushan</td>
<td>$50,000.00</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$50,000.00</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46 21 36</td>
<td>Rotary Lobe Pumps</td>
<td>Berger</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$85,000.00</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46 21 39</td>
<td>Submersible Pumps in SBR, Digesters, and Sludge Holding, Incl. of Jet Aeration Pumps</td>
<td>Wolf</td>
<td>$85,000.00</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46 32 60</td>
<td>Dissolved Air (CA)</td>
<td>Xylem</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46 42 39</td>
<td>Preliminary Treatment Equipment</td>
<td>Lamela Corp.</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$50,000.00</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46 46 10</td>
<td>Septic Tank Equipment Including Jet Aeration Pumps</td>
<td>Enzg</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46 46 15</td>
<td>Rotary Sludge Press Equipment &amp; Clarifiers</td>
<td>Formier</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46 53 33</td>
<td>Polymer Blending &amp; Feed Equipment</td>
<td>Excel Feeder, Inc.</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46 41 13</td>
<td>Submersible Mixers in Post Equalization Tanks</td>
<td>Xylem</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46 54 04</td>
<td>Automatic Backwash Diverter Equipment</td>
<td>Kruger</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td>$ -</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Schedule B: Schedule A/Tabulation of Major Equipment Items and Products (Addition/ Deduct) | | | |
|---------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------|------------------------|--------------------------------|------------------------|--------------------------------|------------------------|--------------------------------|------------------------|--------------------------------|
| Total Bid Base Bid (Lump Sum, Unit Cost Items and Contingency Allowance and Schedule A/Tabulation of Major Equipment Items and Products) | | | | $36,005,935.00 | $33,515,960.85 | $35,982,000.00 | $38,607,550.26 |

*To the best of my knowledge, I hereby certify that the above is a true and correct tabulation of bids received on May 12, 2020.*

Ryan W. Hafer, PE
Project Manager
WJ & Dinkins & Co., Inc.
NC License No. 89374

Lincoln County
Killian Creek WWTP Phase 3 Design
W20 Project Number: 2017.294.00.01.
PC Construction Reference Contacts  
for Killian Creek WWTP Phase 3 Upgrade

Project: Brunswick WTP Phase I, Brunswick, ME ($18,000,000)  
Contact: Lyon Wadsworth, Wright-Pierce, Project Manager

- Project was a CM @ Risk project.
- PC Construction’s work was a higher quality than normally encountered.
- Project was “professionally managed” by PC.
- OK with Change Orders and PC worked with subs to get best cost and did some on a time and expense basis.
- Consider PC to be a “top tier” contractor working on a different level than normal contractors.
- Their RFI often provided a recommended approach to issues.

Project: Lynchburg Wastewater Treatment Plant CSO Reduction Improvements, $39,800,000  
Contact: Eric Schrader, PE, City of Lynchburg, 434.455.4089

- Project was CM @ Risk.
- Overall project was very good.
- Schedule was pushing but very close.
- Project has extended over 4 years and experienced significant turnover for both PC Construction and subcontractors.
- Change Orders have been reasonable and PC’s role has been an estimate value and negotiate with subcontractors.
- Would have no issues with PC on another project.

Project: Neuse River Wastewater Treatment Plant Expansion Phase 4 ($25,900,000)  
Contact: Ed Stempien, City of Raleigh  919.996.3490

- City of Raleigh’s policy is not to comment on projects. It is, however noted that PC Construction lists the City of Raleigh Neuse River WWTP Phase 3 and a WWTP filter rehabilitation project listed reflecting multiple contracts.

Project: Neuse River Wastewater Treatment Plant Expansion Phase 2 and Phase 3 Projects (P3-$27,000,000)  
Contact: Shannon Dorsey, Hazen & Sawyer (919.349.5999), Construction Manager

- Concrete work performed by PC personnel was great.
- Biggest challenge was toward end of project in project closeout and getting punch list completed. Had to push to get complete. Suggest maintaining enough in retainage to contractor priority.
- Would work with PC again. Work was generally above that of other contractors.
- Was generally able to compromise on Changed Orders. PC was a little
aggressive on initial CO’s but was willing to sit down and work through costs with a give and take without significant problems.

- PC has a lot of resources and was able to pull from other projects in region as needed.
- One issue was getting PC to provide a realistic schedule. They have a tendency to project too optimistically. He had rather they be up front and provide more realistic schedule.
- Be mindful of retainage until work is done.

Project: Daytona Beach, FL Westside Regional Wastewater Reclamation Facility Improvements ($39,800,000)
Contact: Jo Ann Macrina, Deputy Utility Director, 407.377.4341

- Project was CM @ Risk.
- Excellent experience with PC team.
- Project is currently on schedule despite hurricane and Covid-19 virus.
- Change Orders were reasonable, expected and some planned by City.
- City is also using PC Construction on another large project at City Water Plant.

Project: Hickory, NC NE WWTP Expansion ($23,000,000 in 2012)
Contact: Shawn Pennell, Utility Director, 828.323.7500

- Excellent experience with PC team
- Finished 6 months ahead of schedule
- Basically, PC built a new plant “on top” of an existing plant without any service disruptions
- Very detail-oriented

Project: Frederick, MD WWTP Enhanced Nutrient Removal ($44,000,000)
Contact: Stona Cosner, Superintendent of Wastewater Treatment, 301.600.1036

- Average to above average overall experience rating
- Change orders were reasonable and the superintendent made some very good field suggestions to improve the design
- Would welcome working with them again.

The following references were also called and voice messages left with a follow up emails but have not responded:

- Don Benjamin, Hanahan WWTP, Hanahan, SC (843.727.6876)
- Ruddy Mowe, Trap Rock WWTP, Leesburg, VA (571.291.7700)